# **Exhibit A**

# Case 1:23-cv-05177-PKC Document 39-1 Filed 03/25/24 Page 2 of 6

From: Maier, Eric J.

To: <u>Izaak Earnhardt; BOSCO, Veronica; ccoslett@bm.net; Zelcs, George A.; Noss, Walter; Lv, Kate; Clerkin,</u>

Stephanie; jsteinmetz@koreintillery.com; Mark C. Mao; Philip Korologos; Jordan Elias; Ted Maya; Stuart Davidson; MCamozzi@rgrdlaw.com; MAngotti@rgrdlaw.com; Serina Vash; Thorne, John; Goodnow, Christopher

C.; jrubin@moginrubin.com; oliver@moginrubin.com; MRParalegal@moginrubin.com; kmbaxter-

kauf@locklaw.com; pmarkert@cerallp.com; Ellis, Andrew

Cc: SESSIONS, Justina (JKS); MAHR, Eric (EJM); ELMER, Julie (JSE); EWALT, Andrew (AJE); RYBNICEK, Jan (JRYB);

MCCALLUM, Robert; KAPLIN, Lauren; BAYOUMI, Jeanette; EGOUL, Vadim; MURRAY, Sean; STEYL, Matthew; SVENSON, Ross; SYRMOS, Alexia; ZWEIFACH, Ben; BASSETT, Morgan; CERICOLA, Pamela; FAULKNER, Anna;

Reiser, Craig M.; Boisvert, Caroline P.; Bitton, Daniel S.; Pearl, David; Justus, Bradley

**Subject:** RE: In re Google Digital Advertising - Next steps

**Date:** Monday, March 11, 2024 4:24:13 PM

# **Caution: External Email**

#### Hi Veronica and Craig:

Neither Gannett nor Daily Mail agree to Google's proposal. Nothing in the Federal Rules requires a plaintiff to amend its complaint in response to a ruling on a partial motion to dismiss. Nor do we agree that Judge Castel's opinion created any "ambiguity or confusion." And we disagree that Google needs more time to answer Daily Mail's and Gannett's complaints – particularly given Google proposes to delay filing its answers until only weeks before the fact discovery deadline. Under Rule 12(a)(4)(A), Google's answers to Gannett's and Daily Mail's complaints are due on March 15. As Google has twice answered ad tech complaints filed by the group of states led by Texas and answered the separate ad tech complaint filed by the Department of Justice, we expect Google is well positioned to timely answer Gannett's and Daily Mail's complaints as well.

All the best,

Eric

## Eric J. Maier

Kellogg, Hansen, Todd, Figel, & Frederick, P.L.L.C. 1615 M Street, N.W. | Suite 400 | Washington, DC 20036 | (202) 326-7923

NOTICE: This transmission is intended only for the use of the addressee and may contain information that is privileged, confidential and exempt from disclosure under applicable law. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible for delivering the message to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify the sender immediately via reply e-mail, and then destroy all instances of this communication. Thank you.

From: Izaak Earnhardt <iearnhardt@BSFLLP.com>

**Sent:** Friday, March 8, 2024 9:35 PM

**To:** BOSCO, Veronica < Veronica. Bosco@freshfields.com>; ccoslett@bm.net; Zelcs, George A.

<gzelcs@koreintillery.com>; Noss, Walter <wnoss@koreintillery.com>; Lv, Kate

<KLv@KoreinTillery.com>; Clerkin, Stephanie <sclerkin@koreintillery.com>;

jsteinmetz@koreintillery.com; Mark C. Mao <mmao@BSFLLP.com>; Philip Korologos

<Pkorologos@BSFLLP.com>; Jordan Elias <jelias@girardsharp.com>; Ted Maya

<tmaya@ahdootwolfson.com>; Stuart Davidson <sdavidson@rgrdlaw.com>; MCamozzi@rgrdlaw.com; MAngotti@rgrdlaw.com; Serina Vash <svash@hermanjones.com>; Thorne, John < jthorne@kellogghansen.com>; Maier, Eric J. <emaier@kellogghansen.com>; Goodnow, Christopher C. <cgoodnow@kellogghansen.com>; jrubin@moginrubin.com; oliver@moginrubin.com; MRParalegal@moginrubin.com; kmbaxter-kauf@locklaw.com; pmarkert@cerallp.com; Ellis, Andrew <aellis@KoreinTillery.com> **Cc:** SESSIONS, Justina (JKS) < Justina. Sessions@freshfields.com >; MAHR, Eric (EJM) <Eric.MAHR@freshfields.com>; ELMER, Julie (JSE) <Julie.Elmer@freshfields.com>; EWALT, Andrew (AJE) <Andrew.Ewalt@freshfields.com>; RYBNICEK, Jan (JRYB) <Jan.RYBNICEK@freshfields.com>; MCCALLUM, Robert < rob.mccallum@freshfields.com>; KAPLIN, Lauren <lauren.kaplin@freshfields.com>; BAYOUMI, Jeanette < Jeanette.Bayoumi@freshfields.com>; EGOUL, Vadim < Vadim. Egoul@freshfields.com >; MURRAY, Sean < Sean. Murray@freshfields.com >; STEYL, Matthew < Matthew. Steyl@freshfields.com>; SVENSON, Ross <Ross.Svenson@freshfields.com>; SYRMOS, Alexia <Alexia.Syrmos@freshfields.com>; ZWEIFACH, Ben <Ben.Zweifach@freshfields.com>; BASSETT, Morgan <Morgan.Bassett@freshfields.com>; CERICOLA, Pamela < Pamela. Cericola@freshfields.com>; FAULKNER, Anna <Anna.Faulkner@freshfields.com>; Reiser, Craig M. <creiser@axinn.com>; Boisvert, Caroline P. <cboisvert@axinn.com>; Daniel Bitton <dbitton@axinn.com>; dpearl@axinn.com; Bradley Justus <br/><br/>diustus@axinn.com>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] RE: In re Google Digital Advertising - Next steps

#### Counsel -

I write on behalf of Publisher Plaintiffs in response to your proposal:

- 1. Publishers do not plan to file an amended complaint in response to the Court's ruling on Google's motions to dismiss. The scope of remaining claims is clear. The Court dismissed Publishers' allegations regarding Search+ (Act 14) and problematic code (Act 16); all other alleged anti-competitive acts (Acts 1-13 and 15) remain in the case. Thus, an amended complaint is not needed to clarify the scope of the remaining claims. Publishers reserve all rights to amend in accordance with the Federal Rules and relevant court orders.
- 2. Publishers are amenable to a stipulation regarding our state-law antitrust claims to the extent they are based on allegations regarding the anti-competitive acts dismissed by the Court. Please provide a draft stipulation, and we will provide comments and edits as soon as practicable. That stipulation should be filed no later than Wednesday, March 13.
- 3. In light of the approaching discovery cutoff, see ECF 708, it is critical that Google respond promptly to the allegations in Publishers' complaint, which was filed in December 2022. If and only if Google will not file a further letter brief seeking to dismiss any portion of the complaint, Publishers are willing to consent to an extension of Google's time to answer the complaint to Friday, March 29, 2024, fourteen days longer than granted by the Federal Rules. See Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(a)(4)(A); ECF 701.

Thank you.

#### **Izaak Earnhardt**

(he/him) Associate

# BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP

1401 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20005 (t) +1 202 274 1129 (m) +1 919 614 2488 iearnhardt@bsfllp.com

**From:** BOSCO, Veronica < <u>Veronica.Bosco@freshfields.com</u>>

Sent: Wednesday, March 6, 2024 4:14 PM

**To:** <a href="mailto:cooslett@bm.net">ccoslett@bm.net</a>; George Zelcs <a href="mailto:gzelcs@koreintillery.com">gzelcs@koreintillery.com</a>; Noss, Walter

<wnoss@koreintillery.com>; Lv, Kate <<u>KLv@KoreinTillery.com</u>>; Clerkin, Stephanie

<<u>SClerkin@KoreinTillery.com</u>>; <u>jsteinmetz@koreintillery.com</u>; Izaak Earnhardt

<iearnhardt@BSFLLP.com>; Mark C. Mao <mmao@BSFLLP.com>; Philip Korologos

<<u>Pkorologos@BSFLLP.com</u>>; Jordan Elias <<u>jelias@girardsharp.com</u>>; Ted Maya

<tmaya@ahdootwolfson.com>; Stuart Davidson <sdavidson@rgrdlaw.com>;

MCamozzi@rgrdlaw.com; MAngotti@rgrdlaw.com; Serina Vash <svash@hermanjones.com>; John

Thorne <<u>ithorne@kellogghansen.com</u>>; Eric Maier <<u>emaier@kellogghansen.com</u>>; Goodnow,

Christopher C. < cgoodnow@kellogghansen.com >; irubin@moginrubin.com;

<u>oliver@moginrubin.com</u>; <u>MRParalegal@moginrubin.com</u>; <u>kmbaxter-kauf@locklaw.com</u>; <u>pmarkert@cerallp.com</u>

Cc: SESSIONS, Justina (JKS) < <u>Justina.Sessions@freshfields.com</u>>; MAHR, Eric (EJM)

<<u>Eric.MAHR@freshfields.com</u>>; ELMER, Julie (JSE) <<u>Julie.Elmer@freshfields.com</u>>; EWALT, Andrew

(AJE) <<u>Andrew.Ewalt@freshfields.com</u>>; RYBNICEK, Jan (JRYB) <<u>Jan.RYBNICEK@freshfields.com</u>>;

MCCALLUM, Robert < < rob.mccallum@freshfields.com >; KAPLIN, Lauren

<a href="mailto:suren.kaplin@freshfields.com">streshfields.com</a>; BAYOUMI, Jeanette <a href="mailto:suren.kaplin@freshfields.com">streshfields.com</a>; BAYOUMI, B

EGOUL, Vadim < <u>Vadim.Egoul@freshfields.com</u>>; MURRAY, Sean < <u>Sean.Murray@freshfields.com</u>>;

STEYL, Matthew < <u>Matthew.Steyl@freshfields.com</u>>; SVENSON, Ross

<Ross.Svenson@freshfields.com>; SYRMOS, Alexia <Alexia.Syrmos@freshfields.com>; ZWEIFACH,

Ben <Ben.Zweifach@freshfields.com>; BASSETT, Morgan <Morgan.Bassett@freshfields.com>;

CERICOLA, Pamela < <a href="mailto:Pamela.Cericola@freshfields.com">Pamela.Cericola@freshfields.com</a>; FAULKNER, Anna

<<u>Anna.Faulkner@freshfields.com</u>>; Reiser, Craig M. <<u>creiser@axinn.com</u>>; Boisvert, Caroline P.

<<u>cboisvert@axinn.com</u>>; Daniel Bitton <<u>dbitton@axinn.com</u>>; <u>dpearl@axinn.com</u>; Bradley Justus

<br/><br/>bjustus@axinn.com>

**Subject:** In re Google Digital Advertising - Next steps

**CAUTION**: External email. Please do not respond to or click on links/attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Counsel.

Consistent with the Court's prior orders following dismissal rulings in the MDL, we would like to agree on

and propose to the Court a process to streamline matters following the Court's ruling on Google's motions to dismiss. We'd like to avoid any ambiguity or confusion about deadlines and what claims remain in the case. To that end, we propose the following for all remaining plaintiffs other than Inform and Daily Mail. Craig will follow up separately regarding Daily Mail.

- 1. By Friday, March 15, Plaintiffs will file conforming amended complaints, which clarify the narrowed scope of their claims based on Judge Castel's rulings dismissing certain claims.
- 2. To the extent that Plaintiffs still intend to advance state-law antitrust claims, the parties will enter into a stipulation similar to that between the States and Google, i.e., agreeing that state antitrust claims are deemed dismissed to the same extent as federal claims.
- 3. 15 days following agreement on the stipulation and/or conforming amendments (whichever is later), Google may file letter briefs seeking to dismiss Plaintiffs' state-law claims.
- 4. Google's deadline to answer a complaint will be 30 days from the latest of 1 or 2 or, if Google requests leave to move to dismiss state-law claims, 30 days from resolution of such request or subsequent motion.

Please let us know by Friday, March 8 if Plaintiffs are amenable to this proposal. If so, we will draft a proposed stipulation and order outlining the above.

Kind regards, Veronica

#### Veronica M. Bosco

Senior Associate

## Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer US LLP

3 World Trade Center 175 Greenwich Street, 51<sup>st</sup> Floor New York, NY 10007 T +1 646-440-1863 | **M** +1 929-266-7982 Veronica.Bosco@freshfields.com

This e-mail is confidential and may be legally privileged. If you have received it in error, you are on notice of its status. Please notify us immediately by reply e-mail and then delete this message from your system. Please do not copy it, use it for any purpose or disclose its contents to any other person; to do so could be a breach of confidentiality. Thank you for your cooperation. Please contact our IT Helpdesk at <a href="mailto:GloballTServiceDesk@freshfields.com">GloballTServiceDesk@freshfields.com</a> if you need assistance.

Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer US LLP has offices in New York, Silicon Valley and Washington, DC. Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer LLP is a limited liability partnership registered in England and Wales with registered number OC334789, and has offices or associated entities in Austria, Bahrain, Belgium, China, England, France, Germany, Hong Kong, Italy, Japan, the Netherlands, Singapore, Spain, the United Arab Emirates and Vietnam.

Any reference to a partner means a member, or a consultant or employee with equivalent standing and qualifications, of Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer US LLP, Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer LLP or any associated firms or entities.

For information about how Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer processes personal data please refer to this <u>Privacy notice</u>. For further information about Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer, please refer to our website at <u>www.freshfields.com</u>.

# Case 1:23-cv-05177-PKC Document 39-1 Filed 03/25/24 Page 6 of 6

The information contained in this electronic message is confidential information intended only for the use of the named recipient(s) and may contain information that, among other protections, is the subject of attorney-client privilege, attorney work product or exempt from disclosure under applicable law. If the reader of this electronic message is not the named recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the named recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, copying or other use of this communication is strictly prohibited and no privilege is waived. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately notify the sender by replying to this electronic message and then deleting this electronic message from your computer. [v.1 08201831BSF]